

GOD-CHRIST INTERCHANGE IN PAUL: IMPRESSIVE TESTIMONY TO THE DEITY OF JESUS

DON N. HOWELL, JR.*

The full deity of the Lord Jesus Christ is one of the essential doctrines of historic, orthodox Christianity. Most scholarly discussions and defenses of the doctrine involve the marshaling of major proof texts that attribute to Christ the prerogatives of deity and/or those that clearly identify him as *theos*.¹ While such presentations are valuable, the passages cited are often hotly debated and the methodology of proof-texting itself is circumscribed by the isolated and often limited nature of the evidence. When one examines the Pauline corpus, for example, there are perhaps only two verses that clearly designate Jesus Christ as *theos* (Rom 9:5b; Tit 2:13).² Even such decisive passages (at least they are in my view) as Phil 2:5-11 and

* Don Howell is associate professor of New Testament at Japan Bible Seminary, Oogi Machiya Danchi 10-304, Kubo Inari 1-12-3, Iruma Shi, Saitama Ken 358, Japan.

¹ Of the many studies that wrestle with the Pauline and wider NT designation of Jesus Christ as *theos* the following are particularly helpful and cover a wide range of viewpoints: G. H. Boobyer, "Jesus as 'Theos' in the New Testament," *BJRL* 50 (1968) 247-261; R. E. Brown, *Jesus: God and Man* (Milwaukee: Bruce, 1967) 1-38; R. G. Crawford, "Is Christ Inferior to God?", *EvQ* 43 (1971) 203-209; W. Elwell, "The Deity of Christ in the Writings of Paul," *Current Issues in Biblical and Patristic Interpretation: Studies in Honor of Merrill C. Tenney Presented by His Former Students* (ed. G. F. Hawthorne; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1975) 297-308; V. Taylor, "Does the New Testament Call Jesus 'God'?", *ExpTim* 73 (1961-62) 116-118; A. W. Wainwright, "The Confession 'Jesus is God' in the New Testament," *SJT* 10 (1957) 274-299.

² Two excellent studies that defend the attribution of *theos* to Christ in Rom 9:5b and Titus 2:13 respectively are B. M. Metzger, "The Punctuation of Romans 9:5," *Christ and Spirit in the New Testament. Studies in Honour of Charles Francis Digby Moule* (ed. B. Lindars and S. Smalley; Cambridge: Cambridge University, 1973) 95-112; M. J. Harris, "Titus 2:13 and the Deity of Christ," *Pauline Studies: Essays Presented to Professor F. F. Bruce on His 70th Birthday* (ed. D. A. Hagner and M. J. Harris; Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1980) 262-277. Another text often cited is 2 Thess 1:12b: *tēn charin tou theou hēmōn kai kyriou Iēsou Christou*. As in Titus 2:13, the Granville Sharp rule may apply here as well but is probably more than counterbalanced by the fact that (1) *theos hēmōn* occurs in v. 11 and elsewhere in the Thessalonian letters (1 Thess 2:2; 3:9; cf. 3:11, 13; 2 Thess 1:1-2; 2:16) and (2) *kyrios Iēsou Christos* was a fixed confessional formula and would probably not require the article (cf. anarthrous *kyrios* in 1 Thess 4:1; 2 Thess 3:4, 12). It is clear that *ho theos* is for Paul the concrete term of signification for God the Father (while allowing some degree of fluctuation in the suppositional application of the term) and that *ho kyrios* is the apostle's term of signification for the Son of God, Jesus Christ. This is demonstrated with methodological precision in K. Rahner, *Theological Investigations* (New York: Seabury, 1974) 1.125-148. Even as Paul can rarely break his *usus loquendi* of *theos* and apply it explicitly to Christ (Rom 9:5b; Titus 2:13), so fluctuation of usage is also evident in the case of *kyrios*: When OT quotations employ *kyrios*, following the LXX, as the equivalent of the Hebrew *yhwh*, the covenant Lord of Israel (i.e. God) is often in view (Rom 4:8; 9:28-29; 10:16; 11:3, 34; 12:19; 14:11; 15:11; 1 Cor 3:20; 14:21; 2 Cor 6:17-18).

Col 1:15–20 fall terminologically short of the pregnant Trinitarian formulation of later Church creeds. It is my conviction that a broader dimension of Pauline Christological expression—namely, the factor of God-Christ interchange—is often underestimated in the discussions regarding Christ's divine nature. By interchange is meant the overlapping of roles, functions, attributes and prerogatives assigned to both God and Christ in the Pauline literature. My task in the present article, then, is to plot the vast language of interchange where the apostle Paul describes the person and work of the Son in much the same terms as he does the person and work of the Father. Having observed the data, I shall attempt to draw out the implications of the interchange factor for the apostle's understanding of Christ's nature.

Eleven of the thirteen Pauline letters open with salutations that directly coordinate God and Christ. Here the apostle denotes God the Father and Jesus Christ as the co-source of grace and peace (Rom 1:7; 1 Cor 1:3; 2 Cor 1:2; Gal 1:3; Eph 1:2; Phil 1:2; 2 Thess 1:2; Titus 1:4; Phlm 3) or grace, mercy and peace (1 Tim 1:2; 2 Tim 1:2). G. F. Hawthorne points out that the simple *kai* that connects *kyriou Iēsou Christou* with *theou patros*, and the modifications of the normal formula, where *hēmōn* is either altogether omitted (B, D, P, etc., of 2 Thess 1:2) or placed not after *patros* but at the end of the entire phrase (1 Tim 1:2; 2 Tim 1:2; Titus 1:4), make it clear that the coordination of the Father with Christ is the intended Pauline emphasis:

The Lord Jesus Christ is, therefore, as much the source of "grace and peace" as is "God the Father." Thus, in the words of Moule, "the position here occupied by Jesus in relation to God, as well as in many other formulae of the New Testament letters, is nothing short of astounding—especially when one considers that they are written by monotheistic Jews with reference to a figure of recently past history"—for it appears to put Jesus Christ and God the Father on an equal basis.³

In each salutation Paul employs *apo* to coordinate the Father and Christ, as he does in the benediction of Eph 6:23 where the benefits are "peace and love with faith." Pauline usage of *apo* elsewhere also demonstrates interchange: Christ is the source of the Lord's supper tradition (1 Cor 11:23), the transformation of the believer into his image (2 Cor 3:18), and the reward of inheritance (Col 3:24). The Father is the source of Christ's becoming the believer's wisdom, righteousness, sanctification and redemption (1 Cor 1:30), the indwelling Holy Spirit (6:19), and the salvation of believers but destruction of unbelievers (Phil 1:28).⁴

Paul also coordinates the Father and Christ as the object of prayer (1 Thess 3:11; 2 Thess 2:16), the order of their mention itself being interchangeable (God-Lord in the former text, Lord-God in the latter). They are

³ G. F. Hawthorne, *Philippians* (WBC 43; Waco: Word, 1983) 12, citing C. F. D. Moule, *The Origin of Christology* (London: Cambridge University, 1977) 150.

⁴ Paul also twice employs *para* with a Christological referent in the genitive case to indicate source (Eph 6:8; 2 Tim 1:18).

coordinated as the sphere in which the Thessalonian church resides (1 Thess 1:1; 2 Thess 1:1). Paul attributes his apostolic commission to the agency of both the Father and Christ (Gal 1:1). The apostle charges Timothy in the sight of God the Father and Jesus Christ to fulfill his ministry (1 Tim 5:21; 6:13; 2 Tim 4:1). Paul's apostleship is according to (*kata*) the joint command of God and Christ (1 Tim 1:1). The reciprocal glorification of Christ and believers is according to (*kata*) the grace of God and Christ (2 Thess 1:12). The accusative noun that follows *kata* in such texts "specifies the criterion, standard or norm in the light of which a statement is made or is true, an action is performed, or a judgment is passed."⁵ Like *apo*, *kata* is a preposition of interchange: Christ is the standard of the believer's unity of mindset (Rom 15:5), Paul's apostolic instruction (2 Cor 11:17), and the Christian's spiritual foundations (Col 2:8). God is the criterion of the Holy Spirit's intercession (Rom 8:27), the sorrow that leads to repentance (2 Cor 7:9-11), and the creation of the "new man" believers are to put on (Eph 4:24).

Along with the direct coordination of these two persons is the impressive reciprocity of language where Jesus Christ is assigned with synonymous terminology the attributes, prerogatives, roles and actions elsewhere predicated of the Father. Paul uses a number of the same appellations for both Christ and God. The Father is the God of peace (1 Thess 5:23), Jesus is the Lord of peace (2 Thess 3:16). The Father is the God of hope (Rom 15:13), Christ Jesus is our hope (1 Tim 1:1). Both God (1 Tim 1:1; 2:3; 4:10; Titus 1:3; 2:10; 3:4) and Christ (2 Tim 1:10; Titus 1:4; 2:13; 3:6) are Savior. Christ is the one Lord of all (Rom 10:9, 13; 1 Cor 8:6; Eph 4:5); the Father is Lord of lords (1 Tim 6:15).

Christ possesses the same attributes as God. The apostle Paul qualifies the person of Jesus Christ by the following communicable and incommunicable attributes.

1. *Communicable attributes.* These include (1) love (Rom 8:35, 37; 2 Cor 5:14; Gal 2:20; Eph 3:18-19; 5:2, 25; 2 Thess 2:13, 16); (2) mercy (1 Cor 7:25; 1 Tim 1:2, 13, 16; 2 Tim 1:2, 16, 18); (3) compassion or affection (Phil 1:8; 2:1); (4) meekness and gentleness (2 Cor 10:1); (5) patience (2 Thess 3:5) and long-suffering (1 Tim 1:16); (6) jealousy (1 Cor 10:22); (7) righteousness (2 Cor 6:14-15; 2 Tim 4:8) and sinlessness (2 Cor 5:21; Gal 2:17); (8) truth (Eph 4:21); (9) faithfulness (2 Thess 3:3; 2 Tim 2:13); (10) impartiality (Eph 6:9; Col 3:25; cf. Rom 10:12); (11) wisdom (1 Cor 1:24, 30; 2:16b; Col 2:3) and knowledge (2 Tim 2:19); (12) power (Rom 14:4; 1 Cor 1:24; 5:4; 2 Cor 12:9; 13:3; Eph 6:10; Phil 3:21; 2 Thess 1:9).

2. *Incommunicable attributes.* These include (1) fullness of deity (Col 1:19; 2:9); (2) oneness (Rom 10:12; 1 Cor 8:6; 12:5; Eph 4:5).

⁵ M. J. Harris, "Prepositions and Theology in the Greek New Testament," *The New International Dictionary of New Testament Theology* (ed. C. Brown; Grand Rapids: Zondervan), 3.1200.

Nearly all of the above qualities are also predicated of God the Father, though there is a greater emphasis on the incommunicable attributes of the Father than those of Christ.⁶ Further, the inexhaustible treasure of spiritual riches that belongs to God was Christ's full share in his preincarnate state (2 Cor 8:9). The apostolic message is the unsearchable riches of Christ (Eph 3:8; Col 1:27), for by incorporation into Christ believers are enriched in every way (1 Cor 1:5), receiving his fullness (Eph 1:23; 4:13) according to the wealth of God's glorious riches in Christ (Phil 4:19).⁷

Both God the Father (Rom 11:36; 1 Cor 8:6) and Jesus Christ (Col 1:16b) are the goal of creation.⁸

Paul defines sin primarily as alienation from God, but he can also speak of separation from Christ. When *apo* takes on the idea of separation, specifically relational cleavage, it can refer to God (Gal 1:6) but more frequently to Christ (Rom 8:35; 9:3; Gal 5:4; 2 Thess 1:9; cf. 2 Cor 5:6 where spatial separation is meant).

The motif of judgment is one of the most impressive areas of God-Christ interchange. In a number of passages Paul reveals a God-Jesus fluctuation where both persons emerge as the executor of eschatological judgment.⁹ People will appear before at one time the *bēma* or tribunal of God (Rom 14:10), at another the *bēma* of Christ (2 Cor 5:10). In Rom 14:9–

⁶ The following communicable and incommunicable attributes describe the person of God the Father: (1) *communicable*: (a) love (Rom 1:7; 5:5, 8; 8:39; 9:25; 11:28; 2 Cor 13:11, 13; Eph 2:4; Col 3:12; 1 Thess 1:4; 2 Thess 2:16; 3:5; Titus 3:4); (b) mercy (Rom 9:15–16, 18, 23; 11:30–32; 15:9; 2 Cor 4:1; Gal 6:16; Eph 2:4; Phil 2:27; 1 Tim 1:2; 2 Tim 1:2; Titus 3:5); (c) compassion (Rom 9:15; 12:1; 2 Cor 1:3); (d) kindness (Rom 2:4; 11:22; Eph 2:7; Titus 3:4); (e) forbearance (Rom 2:4; 3:26); (f) longsuffering (2:4; 9:22; cf. 10:21); (g) jealousy (2 Cor 11:2); (h) righteousness (Rom 3:25–26; 9:14–23; Eph 4:24); (i) wrath (Rom 1:18; 2:5, 8; 3:5; 5:9; 9:22; Eph 2:3; 5:6; Col 3:6; 1 Thess 1:10; 2:16; 5:9); (j) truth (Rom 1:25; 2:2; 3:4, 7; 15:8; Col 1:6; 1 Thess 1:9; Titus 1:2); (k) faithfulness (Rom 3:3; 1 Cor 1:9; 10:13; 2 Cor 1:18; 1 Thess 5:24); (l) impartiality (Rom 2:11; Gal 2:6; cf. Rom 3:22); (m) wisdom (Rom 11:33; 16:27; 1 Cor 1:21, 24, 30; 2:7; 3:19; Eph 1:8; 3:10; Col 2:3) and knowledge (Rom 11:33; 1 Cor 8:3; 13:12; Gal 4:9; Col 2:3); (n) power (Rom 1:16, 20; 4:21; 9:17, 22; 11:23; 16:25; 1 Cor 1:18, 24; 2:5; 4:20; 6:14; 15:43; 2 Cor 4:7; 6:7; 9:8; 10:4; 13:4; Eph 1:19; 3:7, 16, 20; Phil 3:10; Col 1:11; 2 Thess 1:11; 1 Tim 6:16; 2 Tim 1:7–8, 12); (2) *incommunicable*: (a) deity (Rom 1:20; Col 2:9); (b) invisibility (Rom 1:20; Col 1:15; 1 Tim 1:17; 6:16); (c) unapproachability (6:16); (d) immortality (Rom 1:23; 9:26; 1 Cor 15:53–54; 2 Cor 3:3; 6:16; Eph 4:18; 1 Thess 1:9; 1 Tim 1:17; 3:15; 6:13, 16); (e) oneness (Rom 3:30; 16:27; 1 Cor 8:4, 6; Gal 3:20; 1 Tim 1:17; 2:5; 6:15); (f) immutability (Rom 11:29); (g) inscrutability (11:33–34; 1 Cor 2:10); (h) eternity (Rom 1:20; 16:26; 1 Tim 1:17; 6:16).

⁷ Paul draws on the same Greek terms for riches to describe the magnificence of the person of God. It is from the wealth (*ploutos*) of his kindness (Rom 2:4), glory (9:23; Eph 3:16; Phil 4:19), wisdom and knowledge (Rom 11:33), and grace (Eph 1:7; 2:7) that God enriches his people (*ploutizō*, 1 Cor 1:5; 2 Cor 9:11; *plouteō*, Rom 10:12; *ploutos*, Eph 1:18). God draws from his fullness (*plērōma*) in order to fill (*plēroō*) his people (3:19). God fills believers with joy and peace (Rom 15:13), all knowledge (15:14), the fruit of righteousness (Phil 1:11), the supply of their every need (4:19), and the knowledge of his will (Col 1:9). God's person is like an inexhaustible storehouse full of priceless treasures—all resident in Christ—out of which he draws to supply the needs of his children.

⁸ Though both persons can be designated the goal of creation and redemption, the Father alone is posited as their final source (Rom 11:36; 1 Cor 8:6).

⁹ L. J. Kreitzer demonstrates that such fluctuation is clearly attested in certain pseudepigraphal writings (e.g. *1 Enoch* 37–71; *T. Abr.* 13:1–2; *T. Moses* 10:3–7) and at least partly

11 God and Christ perform judgment. In the preceding context the believer's ethical conduct is made accountable to the Lord (14:4, 6, 8), while Christ's lordship, involving judicial prerogatives, arises out of his death and resurrection (14:9). It is God before whose tribunal people will stand and give an account (14:10–12; in the quotation of Isa 45:23 *kyrios* refers to God, creating a clear interchange with *kyrieusē* used Christologically in v. 9). In 1 Cor 4:5 the Lord will come at the appointed time to judge the hearts of people, whose final approbation will come from God. In 1 Thess 3:13 Paul prays to the Lord Jesus to establish his people blameless at the Lord's coming in the presence of their God and Father. Similarly in 2 Thess 1:5–10 God and Jesus appear together in unitedly performing final judgment. God is just to usher his people into his kingdom (1:5) and fully recompense their afflictors (1:6–7a), while Jesus will appear in majestic power to punish unbelievers with eternal destruction on the day his glory will be fully manifest to his people (1:7b–10).

The Lord's eschatological judgment will fall on an appointed day, termed the day of the Lord Jesus Christ (1 Cor 1:8), the Lord Jesus (2 Cor 1:14), the Lord (1 Cor 5:5; 1 Thess 5:2; 2 Thess 2:2), Christ Jesus (Phil 1:6), Christ (1:10; 2:16), or simply "the day" (1 Thess 5:4) or "that day" (2 Tim 1:12, 18; 4:8). Here is the ultimate consummation of the OT prophetic day of the Lord (cf. Isa 2:11–17; 13:6–13; Joel 1:15; 2:1–2, 10–11, 31; 3:14–16; Amos 5:18–20; 8:3, 9; 9:11–15). L. J. Kreitzer has carefully catalogued those Pauline passages where "a referential confusion and conceptual overlap between God and messianic representative" is attested and "which speak of the Day of the Lord and are reliant upon theocentric Old Testament texts which have been christologically reinterpreted."¹⁰ Especially clear examples are: Rom 10:13 (Joel 2:32), Rom 11:26 (Isa 59:20), Phil 2:10–11 (Isa 45:23), 1 Thess 3:13b (Zech 14:5b), 2 Thess 1:9b (Isa 2:10b) and 2 Thess 2:8b (Isa 11:4c–d). In each case an OT prophetic depiction of the day of the Lord shows a referential shift of "Lord" from God to Christ as Paul inserts eschatological teaching into his letters.¹¹ The shift is in no way a lessening of the theocentric character of final judgment in Paul. Rather, it is a "conceptual ambiguity" that "helps us understand the delicate balance between theocentricity and christocentricity in Paul's thought."¹² The prerogative of judgment reserved for God (not Messiah) in the OT becomes for Paul in the light of the resurrection and exaltation of Christ as Lord a fully shared and mutually cooperative venture of God and Christ.

The judgment of the Lord Jesus Christ is just. The Lord is a righteous judge (2 Tim 4:8) whose judgment encompasses the living and dead (4:1) and fully reveals the inner secrets of people (1 Cor 4:5), recompensing them according to their works (2 Tim 4:14), whether good or bad (Eph 6:8; Col 3:24),

accounts for Paul's Christological adaptation of various eschatological texts of the OT (*Jesus and God in Paul's Eschatology* [Sheffield: JSOT, 1987] 99–106).

¹⁰ Ibid. 113.

¹¹ Ibid. 113–128.

¹² Ibid. 129.

and according to their confession (2 Tim 2:12–13). The Lord's judgment is retributive, fully meting out deserved punishment for those who defraud others (1 Thess 4:6b) and vengeance on those who refuse his gospel (2 Thess 1:7–9).¹³

The application of salvation can be predicated of Christ as well as the Father. Christ is the Savior (Eph 5:23; Phil 3:20; 2 Tim 1:10; Titus 1:4; 2:13; 3:6), as is the Father (1 Tim 1:1; 2:3; 4:10; Titus 1:3; 2:10; 3:4). Christ came into the world to save sinners (1 Tim 1:15). The Lord finally "saves" his own into the heavenly kingdom (2 Tim 4:18). Salvation is also regularly attributed to the work of the Father (1 Cor 1:21; Eph 2:8; Phil 1:28; 1 Thess 5:9; 2 Thess 2:13–14; 2 Tim 1:9; Titus 3:4–5). Reconciliation is executed by the Father (2 Cor 5:18–19; Col 1:20, 22) and by Christ (Eph 2:14–17). Believers are called by both the Father (Rom 8:28–30) and by Jesus Christ (Rom 1:6) to be his holy people.¹⁴ A wide variety of terms is used to express the Lord's full participation with the Father in dispensing salvific benefits. He forgives sins (Col 3:13b), removes ungodliness (Rom 11:26), delivers from the present evil age (Gal 1:4), redeems from the curse of the law (3:13), sets free from bondage to the law's yoke (5:1), shines on his people spiritual life (Eph 5:14), sanctifies and cleanses his Church (5:26–27), rescues from the coming wrath of God (1 Thess 1:10) and from sin (Rom 11:26), abolished death and brought life and immortality to light (2 Tim 1:10), redeems from all iniquity and cleanses to himself a chosen people (Titus 2:14), and one day will transform the lowly bodies of believers into those conformable to his own (Phil 3:21).¹⁵

¹³ God the Father's judgment is just. His decree of judgment is righteous (Rom 1:32; 2:5; 3:4–6, 8; 2 Thess 1:5–6), based on truth (Rom 2:2; 3:4, 7), according to a person's works whether good or evil (2:6–10), not based on external appearance (Gal 2:6), but is impartial and according to the amount of light received (Rom 2:11–12), extending even to the secrets of people (2:16). God's just judgment encompasses all people (3:6; 1 Cor 5:13; 2 Thess 2:12), is eternal (1:9) and absolutely inescapable (Rom 2:3; Gal 6:7). God's judgment is retributive, an account settling by God who appraises the extent of the debt and distributes the penalty accordingly (Rom 2:6–10; 12:19; 2 Thess 1:6–7).

¹⁴ C. E. B. Cranfield rightly takes *Iēsou Christou* following *klētoi* in Rom 1:6 as a subjective genitive (contra NIV, which translates as an objective genitive: "called to belong to Jesus Christ") and criticizes those who miss the Pauline God-Christ interchange both here and elsewhere in Romans (*A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Epistle to the Romans* [ICC; Edinburgh: T. and T. Clark, 1975] 1.68 [see n. 3]).

¹⁵ Similar salvific terms are used of the Father's work in bestowing these benefits: He justifies the believer as a free gift of grace (Rom 3:24, 26; 4:6; 8:30, 33; Titus 3:7), whether Jew or Gentile (Rom 3:30; Gal 3:8); he forgives sinners in Christ (Eph 4:32; Col 2:13), not reckoning their trespasses against them (2 Cor 5:19) but reckoning them righteous by faith (Rom 4:6); his kindness leads people to repentance (2:4; 2 Tim 2:25); eternal life is God's gift (Rom 6:23); he shines his light in believers' hearts (2 Cor 4:6); he has qualified his people for the inheritance, rescued them from darkness and transferred them into his Son's kingdom (Col 1:12–13); he loved his people and gave them eternal encouragement and good hope (2 Thess 2:16); he is the one who shows mercy (Rom 9:15, 18; 11:30–32); believers are his workmanship, recreated by him to do good works (Eph 2:10); he sent his Son in order to redeem those under the law (Gal 4:5). The divine passives of *agorazō* (1 Cor 6:20; 7:23) and *hagiazō* (1:2; 6:11; 2 Tim 2:21) point implicitly to the Father's redeeming and sanctifying work respectively.

The object of the Christian's faith is specified at times as God the Father (Rom 4:5, 24; 10:9; 1 Cor 2:5; Col 2:12; 1 Thess 1:8–9; Titus 3:8), but far more frequently as the person of Jesus Christ (Rom 3:22, 26; 9:33; 10:11, 14; Gal 2:16, 20; 3:22, 26; Eph 1:15; 3:12; 4:13; Phil 1:29; 3:9, Col 1:4; 2:5; 1 Tim 1:14, 16; 3:13, 16; 2 Tim 1:12–13; 3:15; Phlm 5). It is the lordship of Jesus that believers confess (Rom 10:9; 1 Cor 12:3; 2 Tim 2:19), he whom they receive (Col 2:6), and his name upon which they call (Rom 10:13; 1 Cor 1:2; 2 Tim 2:22). Similarly believers place their hope in God (2 Cor 1:10; 1 Tim 4:10; 5:5; 6:17) and in Christ (Rom 15:12; 1 Cor 15:19; Eph 1:12; 1 Thess 1:3; 1 Tim 1:1; cf. Col 1:27; Titus 2:13).¹⁶

The new community of faith is inseparably related to both the Father and Christ. The apostle identifies the churches of Judea as "in Christ" (Gal 1:22) but the Thessalonian church as "in God the Father and the Lord Jesus Christ" (1 Thess 1:1; 2 Thess 1:1). Though Paul's normative expression is the "church of God" (1 Cor 1:2; Gal 1:13) or "churches of God" (1 Cor 11:16; 1 Thess 2:14; 2 Thess 1:4), once he refers to "the churches of Christ" (Rom 16:16). Christ's role as authoritative head, cleanser, sanctifier, and nurturing and loving pastor to the Church is a prominent motif in Eph 5:23–32 and reveals how the Church of God is also the Church of Christ (cf. 5:27, where *heautō* implies possession). Believers are beloved by God (1 Thess 1:4) and by the Lord (2 Thess 2:13). The heirship of believers is ultimately assigned to the Father (Rom 8:17; Gal 4:7), but Paul can also say that the reward of inheritance will come from the Lord (Col 3:24). Those in the new community are both the people of God (Rom 9:25–26; 15:10; 2 Cor 6:16; all are OT quotations) and the ones whom Jesus Christ has cleansed for his own chosen people (Titus 2:14). At conversion believers enter into the kingdom of God (Rom 14:17; 1 Cor 4:20; Gal 5:21), of the Lord (2 Tim 4:1, 18), of God's beloved Son (Col 1:13)—that is, the kingdom of God and Christ (Eph 5:5). The kingdom's ultimacy, however, is assigned to God in 1 Cor 15:24, 28 as the Son finally passes the royal scepter to his Father.

While grace is that unmerited and manifold expression of God the Father's favor upon his children,¹⁷ the apostle also writes of the grace of Christ

¹⁶ C. E. B. Cranfield ("Some Comments on Professor J. D. G. Dunn's *Christology in the Making*, with Special Reference to the Evidence of the Epistle to the Romans," *The Glory of Christ in the New Testament. Studies in Christology in Memory of George Bradford Caird* [ed. L. D. Hurst and N. T. Wright; Oxford: Clarendon, 1987] 276–277) believes that God-Christ interchange in the area of the object of faith and hope, particularly in Romans, constitutes "strong evidence of the author's conviction of Christ's oneness with God, and so of his eternity—and so of the author's belief in Christ's pre-existence and in the Incarnation" (p. 277). Appeal is made to the numerous OT texts where God alone is made the proper object of faith and hope (cf. Pss 22:4–5; 27:13–14; 31:14; 38:15; 78:22; 118:8–9; 146:3, 5; Prov 3:5; Isa 7:9; Jer 17:5, 7). "To put absolute faith or hope in anyone or anything but in the one true God is idolatry" (p. 277). Yet "for Paul, faith in God and faith in Christ are inextricably bound together" (p. 276).

¹⁷ God's grace is his unmerited favor extended both in salvific provision and in the continuing sphere of Christian experience. All aspects of the believer's new salvific status, grounded in Christ's death and resurrection and received by faith, are free gifts of divine grace: justification (Rom 3:24; 4:4, 16; 5:15, 17, 20–21; Gal 2:21; 5:4; Titus 3:7); all the blessings of salvation (1 Cor 1:4; 2 Cor 4:15; Eph 1:6; 2:5, 7–8; Phil 1:7; Col 1:6; 2 Thess 2:16; 2 Tim 1:9; Titus 2:11); redemption and forgiveness (Eph 1:7); election of a believing remnant within national Israel

(not including the eleven salutations mentioned above where the Father and Christ are invoked as the co-source of grace and peace). The Christ-event itself, including his incarnation and atoning death, and the salvific riches that accrue from that event spring from the grace of the Lord Jesus Christ (2 Cor 8:9). God's call to salvation is by the instrumentality of Christ's grace (Gal 1:6). Paul attributes his own conversion to the abundant outpouring of the Lord's grace (1 Tim 1:14). The eternal encouragement and good hope of salvation is attributed mutually to the grace of God and Christ (2 Thess 2:16)¹⁸ as is the mutual glorification of Christ and believers through their worthy conduct (1:12). It is the grace of the Lord that apportions spiritual gifts for ministry in the Church (Eph 4:7), that enables the apostle to prove Christ's sufficiency in all circumstances (2 Cor 12:9), and that is the sphere in which the Christian leader is fortified (2 Tim 2:1). While the references to Christ's grace are far less frequent than those where God the Father is referent, there is a wide area of coverage: the Christ event, salvific calling and benefits, spiritual gifts, enablement, strength, glorification.

Spiritual benefits flow from the person of Christ to the believer and include peace (Col 3:15; 2 Thess 3:16; cf. salutations above), mercy (salutations in 1 Tim 1:2; 2 Tim 1:2), strength to make his servant stand (Rom 14:4), and the full dimensions of his love through his indwelling presence (Eph 3:17–19a). Using a variety of verbs Paul ascribes to Christ a broad range of ministries on behalf of his people: He is rich toward (Rom 10:12), received (15:7), transforms (2 Cor 3:18), presents to himself as glorious and blameless (Eph 5:27; Col 1:22), nourishes and cherishes (Eph 5:29), strengthens (Phil 4:13; 1 Tim 1:12; 2 Tim 4:17), guides (1 Thess 3:11; 2 Thess 3:5), causes to increase and makes to abound in love (1 Thess 3:12), establishes (3:13; 2 Thess 2:17; 3:3), loves (Rom 8:37; Gal 2:20; Eph 5:2, 25; 2 Thess 2:16), encourages (2:17), keeps (3:3), gives understanding (2 Tim 2:7), gives eternal encouragement and good hope (2 Thess 2:16), gives mercy (2 Tim 1:16, 18), stands by in defense of (4:17), and rescues from every danger (4:18).¹⁹

(Rom 11:5, 29); eternal life (6:23). The grace of God is also the operative principle of the Christian life (5:2; 6:1, 14–15; 2 Cor 6:1; 2 Thess 1:12). Spiritual gifts in the Church are given by grace (Rom 12:6; cf. Eph 4:7; 2 Tim 1:6). One's calling in life is a gift from God (1 Cor 7:7). The ministry of giving to the needs of other believers is itself a grace (16:3; 2 Cor 8:4, 6–7, 19; 9:8) because it springs from and multiplies the surpassing grace of God toward the givers (8:1; 9:14). God freely gives to his children, along with his beloved Son, all things (Rom 8:32; 1 Cor 2:12), including the privilege of believing in Christ and suffering on his behalf (Phil 1:29).

¹⁸ F. F. Bruce observes in 2 Thess 2:16–17 as in 1 Thess 3:11 the composite subject with a singular verb and the interchangeable order of the two persons: "In such a context God and Christ are so completely united in action that either may be named before the other without making any difference to the sense" (*1 and 2 Thessalonians* [WBC 45; Waco: Word, 1982] 195).

¹⁹ Likewise Paul employs a variety of verbs with *theos* as their subject to indicate the manifold ministries of God the Father on the believer's behalf: He establishes (Rom 16:25; 1 Cor 1:8; 2 Cor 1:21; Col 2:7; 2 Thess 2:17), has loved (Eph 2:4; 2 Thess 2:16), has given eternal encouragement and good hope (2:16), searches (Rom 8:27), encourages (2 Cor 1:4; 7:6; 2 Thess 2:17), strengthens (Eph 3:16; Col 1:11), guides (1 Thess 3:11), keeps (5:23; 2 Tim 1:12), sanctifies (1 Cor 1:2; 6:11; 1 Thess 5:23; 2 Tim 2:21), reveals to (1 Cor 2:10; Phil 3:15), receives (Rom 14:3). God works on behalf of (8:28) and within (Eph 3:20; Phil 2:13; cf. 1 Thess 2:13) the lives of his people.

The eminent provision for the believer's spiritual life is the Holy Spirit. The Spirit is often designated the Spirit of God (Rom 8:9, 14; 1 Cor 2:11, 14; 3:16; 6:11; 7:40; 12:3; Phil 3:3) because it is the Father who is the source of this gift (Rom 8:15; 1 Cor 2:12; 6:19; 2 Cor 1:22; 5:5; Gal 3:5; 4:6; Titus 3:6). But this divine provision can also be qualified Christologically: the Spirit of his Son (Gal 4:6), the Spirit of Jesus Christ (Phil 1:19), the Spirit of the Lord (2 Cor 3:17), the Spirit of Christ (Rom 8:9). The interchange factor is particularly striking in Rom 8:9 where the apostle refers to *pneuma theou* and *pneuma Christou* in practically the same breath. "The ease with which Paul can pass from the one expression to the other is one more indication of his recognition of the divine dignity of Christ."²⁰

The believer maintains a dual responsibility to God the Father and to Jesus Christ. He is to serve (Rom 12:11; 14:18; 16:18; Eph 6:7; Col 3:24) as his servant (1 Cor 7:22; Eph 6:6), conform to (Rom 8:29; 2 Cor 3:18; cf. Gal 4:19), clothe himself with (Rom 13:14), live for (14:8; 2 Cor 5:15), die for (Rom 14:8), orient his actions toward (14:6), abound in the work of (1 Cor 15:58), boast in (1:31; 2 Cor 10:17), submit to and fulfill the law of (1 Cor 9:21; Gal 6:2), not test (1 Cor 10:9), not provoke to jealousy (10:22), imitate (11:1; 1 Thess 1:6), love (1 Cor 16:22; Eph 6:24; 2 Tim 4:8), fear (2 Cor 5:11; Eph 5:21; Col 3:22), give oneself to (2 Cor 8:5), attain to the stature of (Eph 4:13), grow into (4:15), sing to and praise in one's heart (5:19), be subject to (5:22, 24), obey (2 Cor 10:5; Eph 6:5), learn of (4:20), magnify (Phil 1:20), have the mind of (2:5; cf. 1 Cor 2:16b), seek the things of (Phil 2:21; cf. Col 3:1), know (Phil 3:8, 10), walk worthy of (Col 1:10), please (1 Cor 7:32; 2 Cor 5:9; Col 1:10; 3:20), be concerned with the things of (1 Cor 7:32–35), test what is acceptable to (Eph 5:10), do everything as to (Col 3:23), glorify (2 Thess 1:12), and maintain devotion to (1 Tim 5:11) the person of Christ. The believer endeavors to understand what the Lord's will is in moral decisions (Eph 5:17). Accountability to the Lord (Rom 14:4) stems from the Lord's presence in heaven (Eph 6:9; Col 4:1), the believer's belonging to him (Rom 7:4; 14:8), being united to him (1 Cor 6:17) and being placed as a member of his body (6:13, 15) under his headship (11:3; Eph 1:22). Christ's person (2 Cor 13:5; Gal 2:20; Eph 3:17), peace (Col 3:16) and word (3:17) indwell the believer and stimulate spiritual and moral response. Paul can summarize the entire Christian experience as conditioned by the person of Christ: Christ is our life (3:4). To live is Christ (Phil 1:21).²¹

²⁰ Cranfield, *Romans* 1.388.

²¹ The same dimensions of spiritual response and accountability in the Christian life are oriented toward the person of God the Father. The believer is to live for (Rom 6:10–11; Gal 2:19), offer himself as an instrument of righteousness (Rom 6:13) and a living sacrifice to (12:1), love (8:28; 1 Cor 2:9; 8:3; 2 Tim 3:4), serve (1 Thess 1:9; cf. Rom 6:6, 16; 7:6; Gal 4:8–9), bear fruit to (Rom 7:4), grow in the knowledge of (Col 1:10), sing with gratitude in one's heart to (3:16), rejoice in (Rom 5:2, 11), obey the commands of (1 Cor 7:19; 9:21), imitate (Eph 5:1), walk worthy of (1 Thess 2:12), and glorify (1 Cor 6:20; 10:31) the person of God the Father. The believer is to test (Rom 12:2), do from the heart (Eph 6:6), be filled with the knowledge of (Col 1:9), and stand fully assured in all (Col 4:12) the will of God, which is his sanctification (1 Thess 4:3, 7). The Christian life as a stewardship with accountability to God is a dominant Pauline motif. Believers are to please God or be acceptable to God in their attitudes and conduct (4:1). What pleases God is

Although prayer, thanksgiving, glory and blessing are predominantly theocentric concepts in Paul, they can also be directed toward Christ. The apostle can direct his prayers to both God and Christ jointly (1 Thess 3:11; 2 Thess 2:16–17) or to Christ alone (Rom 10:13; 1 Cor 1:2; 2 Cor 12:8; 1 Thess 3:12; 2 Thess 3:5; 3:16; 2 Tim 2:22).²² The single exception to the pattern of thanks being offered exclusively to God the Father is 1 Tim 1:12, where Paul gives thanks to Christ Jesus for strength in fulfilling the apostolic commission to which he appointed him.²³ Glory, normally a theocentric concept in Paul, is at times given a Christological referent in each of its three major Pauline uses. (1) In its descriptive sense *doxa* connotes the radiance or splendor inherent in the Lord (1 Cor 2:8; 2 Cor 3:18; 4:4; 2 Thess 1:9; Titus 2:13). God's own glory is resident in the person of Jesus Christ (2 Cor 4:6). (2) The full unveiling of Christ's glory will occur at his second advent (2 Thess 1:9–10; Titus 2:13). Believers will share in that eschatological state of glory by virtue of their incorporation into Christ: They will be translated into that glory (Col 3:4) and glorified with him (Rom 8:17), their bodies made conformable to his glorious body (Phil 3:21). They share proleptically in that glory even now (Rom 8:29–30; 2 Cor 3:18; 4:6; 2 Thess 1:12). (3) The ascription of glory to Christ by his people is the motivation behind the apostolic ministry (2 Cor 8:19, 23), the purpose of the believer's faithful walk (2 Thess 1:11–12), and the outcome of the revelation of his majesty at his second coming (1:10). Once Paul breaks out in doxological praise to the Lord (2 Tim 4:18b).²⁴ Similarly

dedication to his will (Rom 12:1–2), each brother building up and not tearing down his brother (14:18); obedience and not rebellion (1 Cor 10:5); cheerful giving (2 Cor 9:7); sacrificial giving (Phil 4:18); a peaceful and quiet manner of life (1 Tim 2:2–3); caring for one's parents (5:4). Accountability is the full consciousness that one walks "before God" (Rom 14:22; 2 Cor 7:12; 1 Thess 3:13; 1 Tim 2:3; 5:4), never forgetting that God observes, tests and judges both the heart and the actions (cf. Acts 1:24; 15:8). The pleasure of God is not elicited by human strivings, for it is God who works in believers' hearts to do and will that which pleases him (Phil 2:13).

²² Paul's normal pattern is to direct prayer toward God the Father. In all, there are 45 explicit passages on prayer in the Pauline corpus: 21 specify God or God the Father as the object (Rom 1:9–10; 10:1; 11:2; 15:5, 13, 30–32; 1 Cor 11:4–5, 13; 14:2, 13–15, 28; 2 Cor 13:7–9; Eph 1:16–19; 3:14–19; Phil 1:3–4; 4:6–7; Col 1:3, 9–11; 4:2–4; 1 Thess 1:2–3; 5:23; 2 Thess 1:11; 2 Tim 1:3; Phlm 4–6); six imply God in the immediate context (Rom 8:26–27; 2 Cor 1:11; 9:14; Phil 1:9–11; 1 Thess 3:10; 1 Tim 5:5); in nine references the object of prayer is not mentioned or clarified in the context (Eph 6:18–20; Phil 1:19; Col 4:12; 1 Thess 5:25; 2 Thess 3:1–2; 1 Tim 2:1–2; 2:8; 4:5; Phlm 22). This leaves the nine Christological references (listed above) where Christ is the sole or joint object of prayer.

²³ When the object of thanksgiving is specified, with the exceptions of Rom 16:4 (Priscilla and Aquila) and 1 Tim 1:12 (Christ Jesus) it is exclusively God the Father who is offered thanksgiving.

²⁴ The descriptive, stative (or eschatological) and ascriptive usages of *doxa* and its cognates find their characteristic reference point in God the Father. (1) Glory is inherently God's, which he communicates to man in salvation and then draws from in order to spiritually enrich his people (Rom 1:23; 3:23; 6:4; 9:23; 2 Cor 4:6; Eph 1:17; 3:16; Phil 4:19; Col 1:11; 1 Tim 1:11). (2) God the Father both initiates and consummates the entire glorification process. God destined his people for glory before time began (1 Cor 2:7), electing them to obtain salvation in Christ with eternal glory (2 Tim 2:10). His glorification of believers completes the chain that begins with foreknowledge (Rom 8:30). What the Father purposed he now applies. He calls believers

blessing is once ascribed to Christ (Rom 9:5a).²⁵ Even with the most dominant of theocentric motifs, then, a Christological referent is at times attested.

Finally, when Paul refers to his ministry as apostle to the Gentiles there is a God-Christ interchange. While Paul never calls himself *apostolos theou*—only *apostolos Christou* (1 Cor 1:1; 2 Cor 1:1; Eph 1:1; Col 1:1; 1 Thess 2:6; 1 Tim 1:1; 2 Tim 1:1; Titus 1:1)—he does relate his apostolic commission to the agency (Gal 1:1) and direct command (1 Tim 1:1) of Christ and God. He thus views himself and his associates as (1) bondslaves of both God (Titus 1:1) and Christ (Rom 1:1; Gal 1:10; Phil 1:1; Col 4:12; 2 Tim 2:24) and (2) servants of both God (2 Cor 6:4) and Christ (11:23; Col 1:7; 1 Tim 4:6; cf. 1:12). Paul relates his apostolic commission to the person of Christ in much the same terms as he does to the Father. Christ sent him to preach the gospel (1 Cor 1:17), gave him authority to edify the Church (2 Cor 10:8; 13:10), appointed him to his service (1 Tim 1:12), and enlisted him as a soldier (2 Tim 2:4). He was shown mercy by the Lord (1 Cor 7:25) and considered faithful to prosecute the Gentile mission (1 Tim 1:12). Paul's apostolic calling was mediated by Jesus Christ (Rom 1:5). The defense of his credentials is based on receiving a direct revelation of the risen Lord Jesus (1 Cor 9:1; 15:8; Gal 1:12). His calling is to bear the name of Christ (Rom 1:5), to testify of his Lord (2 Tim 1:8), to lay the foundation of the Church, which is Jesus Christ (1 Cor 3:11; cf. 3:16–17 where the Church itself is God's temple) and to work the work of the Lord (16:10; Phil 2:30). Christ, as well as God, empowers the apostolic ministry. Christ speaks in Paul, working powerfully among the churches (2 Cor 13:3). He effects through Paul the obedience of faith of the Gentiles (Rom 15:18). Christ grants to his servant strength (1 Tim 1:12), all-sufficient power even in weakness (2 Cor 12:9), and the fullness of his blessing (Rom 15:29). Guidance, in this case travel plans to Corinth, is provided in accordance with Christ's will (1 Cor 4:19; 16:7). It is the sufferings of Jesus that Paul participates in as he carries out his commission (2 Cor 1:5; 4:10–11; Gal 6:17; Phil 3:10; Col 1:24; 2 Tim 2:3). Yet even in the most acute weakness the apostle proves the sufficiency of the Lord's

to this glory (1 Thess 2:12; 2 Thess 2:14). The riches of the glory of this inheritance is from God (Eph 1:14, 18; cf. Col 1:12). His salvific work involves the present and future transformation of the believer into the likeness of God, which was God's original design for man—a likeness perfectly represented by the glorified Christ (Rom 8:29–30; 1 Cor 11:7; 15:43, 49; 2 Cor 3:18; 4:4). What is gradually and partially realized now will be consummated by God at the return of Christ. Believers eagerly anticipate the glory to be revealed (Rom 5:2; 8:18, 21; 2 Cor 4:17; Col 1:27b). The body will be raised in glory (1 Cor 15:43; Phil 3:21). At the judgment God will bestow glory to those who evidence their faith by good works (Rom 2:7, 10). The Church will be supremely glorious, holy and blameless in perfection (Eph 5:27). (3) The glory of God the Father is consistently specified as the final goal of the redemptive program (Rom 1:21; 3:7; 15:6–7, 9; 1 Cor 6:20; 10:31; 2 Cor 1:20; 4:15; 9:13; Gal 1:24; Eph 1:6, 12, 14; Phil 1:11; 2:11). Seven of the eight formal doxologies in Paul's letters (one is Christological, 2 Tim 4:18b) ascribe glory to God the Father (Rom 11:36; 16:27; Gal 1:5; Eph 3:21; Phil 4:20; 1 Tim 1:17; 6:16b).

²⁵ Other than the probable exception of Rom 9:5b (see n. 2) the Pauline *bērākôt* are uniformly theocentric, whereby the Father is ascribed blessing as the ultimate source of the manifold redemptive blessings in Christ (Rom 1:25b [Creator]; 2 Cor 1:3; 11:31b; Eph 1:3).

grace (2 Cor 12:9) in continuity with the abundant outpouring of his grace at his conversion/commission (1 Tim 1:14). To the Lord who called and empowers him Paul is accountable. It is the Lord's commendation and not the approval of man that he seeks (2 Cor 10:18), though he takes pains to do what is right before the Lord and people (8:21). Paul endeavors to please the Lord who enlisted him as his soldier (2 Tim 2:4). It is the Lord who appraises him, including his hidden motives (1 Cor 4:4–5), and before whose tribunal he will be judged (2 Cor 5:10; cf. 1 Thess 2:19). Paul executes his apostolic charge in the presence of God and Christ jointly (1 Tim 5:21; 6:13; 2 Tim 4:1), or he can adjure the Church by the Lord alone (1 Thess 5:27).²⁶

The extensive breadth of this interchange of God-Christ language—one that encompasses appellations, attributes, the goal of creation, execution of eschatological judgment, salvation and its corollaries, the object of faith and hope, source of spiritual benefits to believers including the Holy Spirit, reference point for the believer's accountability, possessor of Church and kingdom, recipient of prayer, blessing, glory and thanks, and the source of the apostolic commission, its power, and the direction of its final accountability—demands to be given greater attention in discussions

²⁶ The same dimensions of his apostleship that Paul can orient to Jesus Christ—commission, empowerment and accountability—are also related to the person of God the Father. (1) God is the great commissioner of the apostolic mission (Rom 1:1; 12:3, 6; 15:15; 1 Cor 3:10; Gal 2:7; Eph 3:2, 7–8; Col 1:25; 1 Thess 2:4; 1 Tim 1:11; 2:7; Titus 1:3). God gave to the apostles the ministry of reconciliation (2 Cor 5:18), committing to them the word of reconciliation (5:19). God appointed first of all apostles (1 Cor 12:28) and gave them to the Church (Eph 4:11). God assigned the limits of the field of ministry (2 Cor 10:13). God determined to separate and call Paul to this mission (Gal 1:15). Paul is thus called to be a faithful steward of God's mysteries (1 Cor 4:1–2), so that the proper administration of his apostolic office is a stewardship (9:17). Paul can only speak as a man sent from God (2 Cor 2:17). (2) Paul is empowered by God. The human servants plant, but it is God who causes the seed to grow (1 Cor 3:6–7). God delivers his servants from death and danger (2 Cor 1:10), leads his servants in triumphal procession (2:14a), makes them sufficient for their task (3:6) and humbles his servant in order to crush every remnant of self-sufficiency (12:21). God is mightily at work in Paul's ministry, validating his apostleship to the Gentiles (Gal 2:8) and energizing his work of proclamation and perfection (Col 1:28–29). Paul's travel plans to Rome are submitted to the overruling will of God (Rom 1:10; 15:32). Paul repeatedly emphasizes that his apostleship is a gift of God's grace (12:3, 6; 15:15; 1 Cor 3:10; Gal 1:15; 2:9; Eph 3:2, 7–8; 4:7, 11) and that his total reliance is on God's power and sufficiency in carrying out his mission (2 Cor 1:9–10, 12b; 3:4–5; 4:7; 6:7; 13:4b; 1 Thess 2:2; 2 Tim 1:7). "By the grace of God I am what I am . . . not I but the grace of God" is the motto of his apostolate (1 Cor 15:10). (3) The One who commissions and empowers is also the One to whom his servants are accountable. Paul carries out his commission "before God," delineating the ministry as performed in the presence or audience of God (2 Cor 2:17; 4:2; 12:19; 1 Thess 3:9; 1 Tim 5:21; 6:13; 2 Tim 4:1). He conducts himself in the truthfulness and sincerity that come from God (2 Cor 1:12). This sincerity rather than self-commendation in persuading people is plain to God (5:11). Even his supposed madness, a charge leveled by the false apostles in Corinth, is for God's sake (5:13). When he speaks, Paul seeks to please God who tests the heart (1 Thess 2:4b). It is God's approval, not man's, that he seeks to gain (Gal 1:10). Thus Timothy is charged to present himself as a workman approved to God (2 Tim 2:15). Other than 1 Thess 5:27 (the single Christological adjuration cited above), Paul uniformly employs oath formulas to appeal to God as the ultimate authority to confirm the authenticity of his assertions (Rom 1:9; 2 Cor 1:18, 23; 11:11, 31; 12:3b; Gal 1:20; Phil 1:8; 1 Thess 2:5, 10).

of NT and, in particular, Pauline Christology. There is an ontological element here where Christ's divine nature is given clear expression, not just in a few isolated texts but across the expansive horizon of Pauline thought. One Pauline scholar who has felt the force of this interchange and its implications is C. E. B. Cranfield:

In this epistle (Romans)—and the same could be said of other Pauline letters—Paul again and again and in a rich variety of ways associates Christ with God with an uninhibitedness, which, because it is so familiar, we are apt to pass over without noticing, but which, when once we begin to reflect on the implications of what we are reading, can scarcely fail to strike us as altogether extraordinary and astonishing.²⁷

For Cranfield (and for me) such language unquestionably points to the essential oneness in activity and nature of Jesus Christ with God. When combined with the Pauline references to the Holy Spirit it constitutes a theology that, at least in elementary form (though not perhaps in the full-orbed Trinitarianism of the later ecumenical councils), is Trinitarian in character.²⁸

²⁷ Cranfield, *Romans* 2.839.

²⁸ Cranfield ("Comments" 274–280) surveys the interchange factor in Romans and concludes that Dunn, in his attempt to avoid the ontological element in Paul's Christology, fails to grasp "the measure of the sheer intellectual power and alertness of the author of the epistle to the Romans" (p. 280).